Name: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ TP: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_

**CW/HW: THE TRIAL**  
Honors Geometry  
Due Date: Tuesday, Nov. 26th, 2013



**We are not ruling in your favor. You clearly did not pass your high school geometry class.**

Think of the last time you watched a courtroom daytime TV show. The arguments you heard were probably not the most impressive examples of logic. Have you ever wondered about how judges or juries make a decision in a courtroom? The facts of a case are very important, but the reality of the American legal system is that **the way you form an argument** can sometimes be even more important than the facts.

Study the following courtroom trial. It will be the basis of your Quarter 2 portfolio assignment. Answer “The Trial” questions reading through the arguments.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Definitions** | | |  | | | |  | | | |
|  | |  |  | | | |  | | | |
| Defendant = person who has been formally charged with a crime or violation | | | | | | | | | | |
|  | |  |  | | | |  | | | |
| Plaintiff = person bringing a complaint before the court | | | | | | |  | | | |
|  | |  |  | | | |  | | | |
| Counter suit = when the defendant responds with a complaint against the plaintiff | | | | | | | | | | |
| **The Trial** | | |  | | | |  | | | |
|  | |  |  | | | |  | | | |
| **Given** | | |  | | | |  | | | |
| **What both sides agree on (not necessarily in order)** | | | | | | | | | | |
|  | |  |  | | | |  | | | |
| 1 | | Both parties were driving and the plaintiff pulled up next to the defendant | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | | There was an exchange of harsh words |  | | | |  | | | |
| 3 | | The defendant threw a beer bottle at the plaintiff's car | | | | |  | | | |
| 4 | | The plaintiff pulled in front of the defendant and slammed on his brakes | | | | | | | | |
| 5 | | Both parties pulled into a parking lot |  | | | |  | | | |
| 6 | | The plaintiff punched the defendant |  | | | |  | | | |
|  | |  |  | | | |  | | | |
| **Prove** | | |  | | | |  | | | |
| **There are two in this case due to the counter suit** | | | | | | |  | | | |
|  | |  |  | | | |  | | | |
| A. | | The defendant is financially responsible for the damage to the plaintiff's car | | | | | | | | |
| B. | | The plaintiff is financially responsible for the medical bills to the defendant's car | | | | | | | | |
|  | |  | | |  | | |  | | | |
| **The Offense** | | | | |  | | |  | | | |
|  | |  | | |  | | |  | | | |
| **PLAINTIFF PROOF (A-1)** | | | | |  | | |  | | | |
|  | |  | | |  | | |  | | | |
| 1 | | The beer bottle caused the damage to my car | | | 1 | | | Laws of physics | | | |
| 2 | | The defendant threw the beer bottle | | | 2 | | | Given | | | |
| 3 | | The defendant caused damage to my car | | | 3 | | | Substitution | | | |
| 4 | | The defendant is responsible for the damage to my car | | | 4 | | | If you cause damage to another or their | | | |
|  | |  | | |  | | | property, then you are financially responsible for the damage you cause | | | |
| **DEFENDANT PROOF (B-1)** | | | | |  | | |  | | | |
|  | |  | | |  | | |  | | | |
| 1 | | The plaintiff punched me | | | 1 | | | Given | | | |
| 2 | | The punch inflicted on me caused medical damage | | | 2 | | | Laws of physics | | | |
| 3 | | The plaintiff caused the damage | | | 3 | | | Transitive | | | |
| 4 | | The plaintiff is responsible for the medical damage | | | 4 | | | If you cause damage to another or their | | | |
|  | |  | | |  | | | property, then you are financially responsible for the damage you cause | | | |
|  | |  | | |  | | |  | | | |
|  | |  |  | | | |  | | | |
| **The Defense** | | |  | |  | | | |
|  |  | |  | |  | | | |
| **PLAINTIFF PROOF (A-2)** | | |  | |  | | | |
|  |  | | |  | |  | | | |
| 1 | I thought I was going to be hit if I didn't hit the | | | 1 | | The defendant walked toward me with clenched | | | |
|  | defendant first | | |  | | fists and was angry | | | |
| 2 | I am not responsible for the defendant's bills | | | 2 | | If you act in self-defense, you are not financially | | | |
|  |  | | |  | | responsible for your actions | | | |
|  |  | | |  | |  | | | |
| **DEFENDANT PROOF (B-2)** | | | |  | |  | | | |
|  |  | | |  | |  | | | |
| 1 | I threw the bottle to protect my kids that were | | | 1 | | If I throw a bottle at a moving object, then it will | | | |
|  | in the car with us from his swerving car | | |  | | substantially alter its course | | | |
| 2 | I am not responsible for the plaintiff's bills | | | 2 | | If you act in self-defense, you are not financially | | | |
|  |  | | |  | | responsible for your actions | | | |

DIRECTIONS: Use **THE TRIAL** to answer the following questions. **Answer in complete sentences.**

1. What is the difference between a defendant and a plaintiff?

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

1. What is a counter suit?

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

1. What was thrown at the plaintiff’s car?

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

1. Who punched who?

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

1. In proof (A-1), what reason does the plaintiff give for the beer bottle causing damage to the car?

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

1. According to reason 4 in proof (B-1), when would someone be financially responsible?

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

1. What did the plaintiff have to prove in their defense (A-2)?

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

1. In (B-2), why did the defendant throw a beer bottle?

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

**Q2 Portfolio Pre-writing for You Be the Judge!  
Directions:** Determine your ruling in the courtroom case: will you rule in favor of the plaintiff or the defendant? Complete the column that applies to you. **You do NOT need to complete the other column.**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| I will rule in favor of the **PLAINTIFF** | I will rule in favor of the **DEFENDANT** |
| I support the following:   * PLAINTIFF PROOF ( \_\_\_\_ - \_\_\_\_ ) * PLAINTIFF PROOF ( \_\_\_\_ - \_\_\_\_ ) | I support the following:   * DEFENDANT PROOF ( \_\_\_\_ - \_\_\_\_ ) * DEFENDANT PROOF ( \_\_\_\_ - \_\_\_\_ ) |
| The example of a postulate found in the OFFENSE argument is: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ | The example of a postulate found in the OFFENSE argument is: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ |
| Circle one:  This postulate **was was not** used correctly. | Circle one:  This postulate **was was not** used correctly. |
| The problem with PLAINTIFF PROOF (A-1) is:  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  But I can overcome that problem by saying:  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ | The strength of DEFENDANT PROOF (B-1) is:  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  I am basing my ruling on this strength because:  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ |
| I disagree with the following:   * DEFENDANT PROOF ( \_\_\_\_ - \_\_\_\_ ) * DEFENDANT PROOF ( \_\_\_\_ - \_\_\_\_ ) | I disagree with the following:   * PLAINTIFF PROOF ( \_\_\_\_ - \_\_\_\_ ) * PLAINTIFF PROOF ( \_\_\_\_ - \_\_\_\_ ) |
| The strength of PLAINTIFF PROOF (A-2) is:  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  I am basing my ruling on this strength because:  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ | The problem with DEFENDANT PROOF (B-2) is:  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  But I can overcome this problem by saying:  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ |

**Q2 Portfolio Outline for You Be the Judge!**

**Introduction Paragraph**

**Paragraph 1: SUMMARIZE**

Summarize the scenario according to what both parties agree on.

**Paragraph 2: POSTULATES**

Identify geometric postulates used in proofs (A-1) and (B-1) and whether or not they were used correctly.

**Paragraph 3: Argue FOR**

Make a ruling and justify it by supporting the plaintiff’s proofs (A-1 and A-2) or the defendant’s proofs (B-1 and B-2).

Note: you MUST choose a side, you cannot grant both rulings.

**Paragraph 4: Argue AGAINST**

Justify your ruling by arguing against the plaintiff’s proofs (A-1 and A-2) or against the defendant’s proofs (B-1 and B-2).

Note: you MUST choose the same ruling as in paragraph 3, only now you are doing it by arguing against the ruling you did not pick.